

Item:	Construction Contract Award: 25 <sup>th</sup> Street North Bike/Pedestrian Bridge Construction (CTEP), Office File 1306.8
From:	Engineering Division
Initiated By:	Public Works Department
Presented By:	Jim Rearden, Public Works Director
Action Requested:	Consider Bids and Award Construction Contract

# **Suggested Motion:**

1. Commissioner \_\_\_\_\_moves:

"I move the City Commission (award/not award) a contract in the amount of \$216,661.50 to Tamietti Construction for the  $25^{\text{th}}$  Street North Bike/Pedestrian Bridge Construction (CTEP), contingent upon Montana Department of Transportation concurrence, concur in the use of State Congestion Mitigation and Air Quality funds, and authorize the City Manager to execute the necessary documents."

2. Mayor Kelly requests a second to the motion, Commission discussion, public comment, and calls for the vote.

Staff Recommendation: Approve construction contract award.

## **Summary:**

The 25<sup>th</sup> Street North Bike/Pedestrian Bridge CTEP project was approved for funding on July 15, 2003 by the City Commission. A lengthy negotiation to secure a new easement from the railroad for the bridge resulted in the project being delayed until recently. In April of 2015, the City Commission awarded a contract for the fabrication and delivery of a bike/pedestrian bridge to span over a railroad cut that passes under 25<sup>th</sup> Street North near River Drive North. Using the selected bridge, the City's engineering consultant (KLJ Engineering) designed the foundation system for the bridge and developed a construction contract for the installation of the bridge. The work proposed in this contract will install the bridge and provide new sidewalk to both the north and south ends of the bridge. Bids for the construction were opened on December 4, 2015.

The bid results were approximately \$75,000 higher than the engineer's estimate and also higher than the budgeted amount. Therefore, the award of the contract was postponed at the December 15, 2015 Commission meeting to allow City staff to evaluate the bids and pursue funding options for the project. After a review of alternatives, City staff recommends funding the construction contract using the original Community Transportation Enhancement Program (CTEP) funding available to the

City through the Montana Department of Transportation (MDT) and using Congestion Mitigation and Air Quality (CMAQ) Program funds, also provided through MDT, to fill the shortfall.

# **Background:**

# Significant Impacts

This project will install a bike/pedestrian bridge along the east side of 25<sup>th</sup> Street North over an existing railroad line to provide a safe connection from the residential area south of the railway to attractions north of the railway including the Centene Stadium, Montana Veterans Memorial, and Eagle Falls Golf Club.

# Workload Impacts

KLJ Engineering is under contract to provide engineering services for the project. KLJ will also perform the construction inspection. City Engineering staff will perform administration duties. City Planning & Community Development Department staff administers the CTEP program and will assist with project administration duties.

# Purpose / Project Work Scope

The City's Long Range Transportation Plan recommends new pedestrian facilities be "...selected to close gaps in the network, make connections to and from major destinations, and improve overall comfort and sense of security for pedestrians." This CTEP project was initiated in order to provide a safe path of travel for pedestrians and cyclists adjacent to the 25<sup>th</sup> Street North bridge that crosses the railway cut between 8<sup>th</sup> Avenue North and Pasta Place. The existing vehicle bridge does not have a safe width for bicycles, nor a safe, separated sidewalk for pedestrians. The new bike/pedestrian bridge will be located east of the existing bridge, separate from vehicle traffic.

In 2015, the City separately bid and contracted for the pre-fabricated bridge to be delivered to the site as the first phase of this project, in order to design abutments based upon the requirements of the selected bridge. Upon the award of the construction contract, the contractor will construct the bridge abutments and coordinate delivery and installation of the bridge. The contractor will also improve sidewalk facilities from 8<sup>th</sup> Avenue North to the Pasta Montana entrance on the east side of 25<sup>th</sup> Street North. Work is scheduled to start in the spring of 2016.

# **Evaluation and Selection Process**

Three bids were received and opened for this project on December 4, 2015. The bids ranged from \$216,661.50 to \$339,896.12. Tamietti Construction submitted the low bid and executed all the necessary bid documents. The two competitive bids, provided by Sletten Construction and Tamietti Construction, were very close and indicate that the prices reflect the best value available for this project. The bids were higher than the Engineer's Estimate of \$140,000.00, leading the City to postpone award of the bid to provide time to review options for funding and award, including securing additional funds or re-scoping the project.

### Alternatives

Staff considered a number of different options for the project, including:

- 1. Reject the bids and readvertise to secure bids closer to the project budget. The two lowest bids were within \$8,568 of each other (about 4%), indicating a competitive bidding process. In review of the bids, the biggest difference between the engineer's estimate and the contractors' bids was the cost to place the bridge. This difference can be attributed to the existence of overhead power lines which require a longer and more costly method for placement than anticipated by the engineer, in order to avoid impacting the lines. Because of the competitiveness of the bids and the analysis of the difference between the engineer's estimate and the bid amount, staff has concluded readvertising will likely not result in a lower bid.
- 2. Reject the bids, scale back the project and readvertise. There are some items that could be

removed from the project, such as the sidewalk work to the south of the bridge. However, removing this work will leave poor pedestrian access from the south, which is contrary to the intent of the project. For a connected and safe facility, all of the improvements need to be made. In addition, removal of these items would not be enough to bring the project within the budget.

- 3. Reject the bids and shelve the project. This is not a viable alternative, as the bridge has already been purchased. Although the bridge could be sold by the City, the City would be required to refund to the CTEP program all funds received to-date (including CTEP payments associated with engineering fees). Alternatively, the City could delay construction for up to 10 years, but would not receive the CTEP funds for construction and would need to fund the entire cost of the bridge installation.
- 4. Provide additional funds from City sources. If non-City sources of funding are available, staff recommends their use on this project to minimize the financial impact upon the City.
  - a. Private sources of funding. No private sources could be found to support this project.
  - b. Additional CTEP funds. All the CTEP funds available to the City have been committed to other projects. Shifting funds to this project would threaten the viability of the remaining CTEP projects.
  - c. Pursue the use of Montana Department of Transportation "Congestion Mitigation and Air Quality" (CMAQ) funds to supplement the CTEP funding. This funding source is available for new bike and pedestrian facilities and can be used in some instances, if approved by the local Metropolitan Planning Organization (MPO) and MDT.

# Conclusion and Staff Recommendation

Of all the options staff considered, Option 4.c would have the least fiscal impact to the City of Great Falls, and would also help further the goals of the CMAQ Program. In addition, it is the most expedient option, and would allow for the project to be under construction soon. MDT has requested the final remaining CTEP projects be underway in the Spring of 2016, so a timely award of the contract is important.

To that end, City staff recommends awarding the construction contract to the low bidder, Tamietti Construction, in the amount of \$216,661.50, and concurring in the use of CMAQ funds for a portion of the project. Additional matching dollars would be provided through an even split from the City Street Fund and the Park Trust Fund.

### **Fiscal Impact:**

The attached bid tabulation summarizes bids that were received. This project was planned to be funded through CTEP funds, matched with City Street and Park Trust funds already allocated to the project. With bids higher than budgeted dollars, the Great Falls Metropolitan Transportation Planning Process approved the use of Congestion Management and Air Quality improvement funds (CMAQ - Federal transportation dollars) to fund \$59,454.53 of the remaining construction costs. The local match provided by the City Street and Park Funds will also have to increase to meet the 13.42% match of the total dollar amount of the project which includes design, inspection, and construction. For this construction contract, Federal grants will provide \$128,040.00 of the funding through CTEP and \$59,545.52 through CMAQ. The City Street and the Park Trust funds will each provide \$14,537.99 in matching funds. This is approximately \$5,000 more per City fund than was originally budgeted.

### Alternatives:

The City Commission could vote to deny award of the construction contract.

## **Attachments/Exhibits:**

- 1. Bid tabulation
- 2. 25<sup>th</sup> St N Pedestrian Bridge Location Map

#### BID TABULATION SUMMARY

#### CITY OF GREAT FALLS ENGINEERING P.O. BOX 5021 GREAT FALLS, MT 59403

# 25TH STI

OFFICE FILE 1306.8	
TREET NORTH BRIDGE CONSTRUCTION	

	BIDS TAKEN AT	CIVIC CENTER
DATE:		4-DEC-15

						2	<b>1</b> -	D	E	С	-1/	5
TZ	р	т	x	x	7		3	10			<b>T</b>	

TABULATED P

Т

KARI WAMBACH

	NAME & ADDRESS OF BIDDER	ACK. ADD. #1	ACK. ADD. #2	CERTIFICATE OF NON-SEGREGATED FACILITIES	CERTIFICATE OF COMPLIANCE WITH INSURANCE REQ.	10% BID SECURITY	DBE REQ.	CTEP PROPOSAL	TOTAL BID
1	SLETTEN CONSTRUCTION 4801 RIVER DRIVE NORTH GREAT FALLS, MT 59405	V	V	N/A	V	V	V	V	\$225,229.50
2	TAMIETTI CONSTRUCTION 4801 22ND AVENUE NORTH GREAT FALLS, MT 59405	v	v	N/A	V	v	v	V	\$216,661.50
3	BATTLE RIDGE BUILDERS 4505 THORPE ROAD BELGRADE, MT 59714								DID NOT BID
4	GUY TABACCO CONSTRUCTION PO BOX 550 BLACK EAGLE, MT 59414	v	V	N/A	V	V	v	v	\$339,896.12
5									
6									
7									
8									
9									
10									

