# JOURNAL OF CITY COMMISSION WORK SESSION June 2, 2020

City Commission Work Session Civic Center, Commission Chambers Room 206 Mayor Kelly presiding

# CALL TO ORDER: 5:30 p.m.

**CITY COMMISSION MEMBERS PRESENT:** Bob Kelly, Mary Sheehy Moe, Tracy Houck and Rick Tryon. Commissioner Owen Robinson was excused.

**STAFF PRESENT:** City Manager Greg Doyon and Deputy City Manager Chuck Anderson; City Attorney Sara Sexe; Animal Shelter Manager Lynn Formell; Finance Director Melissa Kinzler; and, Deputy City Clerk Darcy Dea.

Due to the COVID-19 health concerns, the format of the City Commission meeting may be modified to accommodate Commission member attendance in person, via a remote location/virtual meeting method, or to appear telephonically. In order to honor the Right of Participation and the Right to Know (Article II, Sections 8 and 9 of the Montana Constitution), modifications have also been made for public participation. Public participation is welcome in the following ways:

- <u>Attend in person</u>. Refrain from attending in person if you are not feeling well. The City will require social distancing at the meeting, and may limit the number of persons in the Commission Chambers according to applicable health guidelines.
- <u>Provide public comments via email</u>. Comments may be sent via email before 5:00 PM on Tuesday, June 2, 2020, to: <u>commission@greatfallsmt.net</u>. Include the agenda item or agenda item number in the subject line, and include the name and address of the commenter. Written communication received by that time will be shared with the City Commission and appropriate City staff for consideration during the agenda item and will be so noted in the official record of the meeting.
- <u>Call-in</u>. The public may call in during the public comment period at <u>406-761-4786</u>. All callers will be in a queued system and are asked to remain on hold and be patient. Calls will be taken in the order in which they are received. Callers will be restricted to customary time limits. We ask for your patience in the event there are technical difficulties.
- material • The agenda packet available is on the City's website: https://greatfallsmt.net/meetings. The Public may view and listen to the meeting on government access channel City-190, cable channel 190; or online at https://greatfallsmt.net/livestream. Public comment will be taken during the meeting as indicated on the agenda with an asterisk.

## **PUBLIC COMMENT**

Sheriff Jesse Slaughter, 3800 Ulm North Frontage Rd, Cascade County Sheriff's Office, commented that the Great Falls Animal Shelter assists the County with regard to animal hoarding cases and that it is a great partnership. Sheriff Slaughter expressed concern with regard to the Maclean-Cameron Animal Adoption Center (MCAAC) not accepting large turn-ins of animals from hoarding cases.

# 1. <u>ANIMAL SHELTER REQUEST FOR PROPOSAL REVIEW</u>

Libbey Winderl, 4501 12th Street NE, Animal Foundation of Great Falls Board of Trustees President, reviewed and discussed the attached PowerPoint presentation covering background, summary of proposal, major advantages of a contract between the city and foundation, conclusion and contact information.

Referring to Sheriff Slaughter's concern, Pam Volk, 1128 23rd Avenue SW, Maclean-Cameron Animal Adoption Center Executive Director, explained that a statement in the original proposal about the MCAAC not accepting animals from hoarding cases was misinterpreted. She clarified that the Heart of the Valley (HOV) Shelter in Bozeman does not accept large turn-ins of animals from hoarding cases. Ms. Volk added that accepting animals from hoarding cases could be further discussed.

Ms. Volk noted that the City would be obligated to assist the County with hoarding cases if there is a contract between the two entities. She explained that the MCAAC has offered to assist the County with regard to a recent hoarding issue; however, the County has not responded. The MCAAC takes in stray animals brought in by the public; however, Animal Control does not bring strays to the MCAAC. Ms. Volk clarified that the MCAAC is not indicating that it provides a better quality of care than the Animal Shelter and respects all that the Animal Shelter does for the community. She explained that quality of care refers to the type of building, spacing and environment provided for the animals.

Ms. Volk explained that the amount in the proposal includes housing animals sent from the Animal Shelter that are past the 96-hour holding period. She expressed concern with regard to receiving electronic communications between the Commission and Deputy City Manager Chuck Anderson in an untimely manner and making it difficult to prepare responses to the questions. She discussed several differences, comparisons, discrepancies and data about the MCAAC and other private and municipal animal shelters.

Commissioner Moe reiterated that her focus remains on cost savings to the City and not as much with the quality of care of animals. She expressed concern that the City would spend more money with regard to the MCAAC's proposal.

Commissioner Tryon concurred with Commissioner Moe with regard to the importance for cost savings to the City and added that he has not seen that with the MCCAC's proposal. He pointed out that the City Finance and Legal Departments' input is important before moving forward. He received clarification that the 2010 Animal Shelter Study is available on the City's website.

Ms. Winderl responded that the MCAAC requested additional information clarifying the City's expenses; however, the MCAAC has not received a clear answer. Ms. Winderl requested to have an additional meeting open to the public and include the City Legal and Finance Departments to help identify an accurate cost. The MCAAC has talked to other private-public partnerships in the state to see how they made things work. At the time that the MCAAC submitted its proposal, construction of the Cattery at the Animal Shelter had already begun with the efforts of the public donating to the Help Us Grow "HUG" Project.

Mayor Kelly inquired about adoption and stray services, as well as the Animal Shelter's biggest concern with regard to sending animals past the 96-hour holding period to the MCAAC.

Animal Shelter Manager Lynn Formell responded that the Animal Shelter's primary responsibility is stray services and not owner-surrendered animals. The Animal Shelter is an open-admission municipal shelter that has an obligation to unowned, abandoned animals. Stray animals are usually put up for adoption after the 96-hour holding period, unless an incarcerated individual will not give up their rights to their animal or if the animal needs rehabilitation. The residual cost for a 96-hour holding period of 1400 stray animals is approximately \$491,000. Other shelters in the state assist the Animal Shelter with adoption services at no charge.

Animal Shelter Manager Formell explained that the Animal Shelter staff has put forth much effort into making several improvements to the facility on a limited budget, including adoptions, lost and found services, and supported the Humane Society over the past several years. Manager Formell continued that her biggest concern would be taking the joy and passion out of the Animal Shelter staff, as well as bringing back the stigma referring to the City Animal Shelter as the City Pound again.

Commissioner Moe expressed concern that there are two entities side-by-side providing a service that is not required by law for either of them and duplicating resources. She commented that the Commission has an obligation to explore ways of saving the City money, as well as addressing all of the concerns discussed tonight.

Commissioner Houck expressed concern about the amount of effort spent focusing on trying to find a cost savings and not knowing if one even exists. She commented that she would rather see the Commission pursue other topics until there is a solid proposal.

Mayor Kelly requested that staff determine the number of animals at the Animal Shelter past the 96-hour holding period due to incarcerated individuals who do not give up their rights to their animals, as well as steps the City can take against these individuals. He added that the goal is to get the animals adopted out to a good home, whether it is the Animal Shelter or the MCAAC. Mayor Kelly suggested having another meeting after receiving clarification and more detail about the information discussed tonight.

## **DISCUSSION OF POTENTIAL UPCOMING WORK SESSION TOPICS**

City Manager Greg Doyon reported that the June 16<sup>th</sup> work session will consist of an update on financing options for the Civic Center Façade as well as the 2020 Budget Primer. The Defense Critical Infrastructure Program (DCIP) Grant topic will be added to an upcoming work session.

## ADJOURN

There being no further discussion, Mayor Kelly adjourned the informal work session of June 2, 2020 at 6:50 p.m.





- · March 3, 2020 City staff provided a presentation on the Foundation's proposal referencing some confusion.
- March 11, 2020 John Huber and Libbey Winderl submitted a letter to the Commission and staff clarifying the proposal and addressing staff's concerns.
- March 17, 2020 Had planned to be on the agenda, but Covid-19 led to major changes and delays.
- Today Further a conversation about a potential agreement betw en the City and the Foundation for adoption and education

Maclean-Cameron Animal Adoption Center

SUMMARY OF PROPOSAL

#### From page 8 of the Proposal:

The Animal Foundation of Great Falls proposes to utilize the Center to assume all responsibility for animal adoption and fostering services, fundraising, and education to the community.

The City of Great Falls would retain responsibility for the intake and imely release to owners of stray animals, 72/96 hour hold periods for impounded strays, operation of its crematorium, and its statutory responsibility for animal control services.





	: A cont	ract with	the Macle	an-Came	ron Anim	nal Adoptio	on Center	THE CITY & FOUNDATION will result in cost savings to the City the Shelter to improve conditions for door, while we
	: A cont	ract with	the Macle	an-Came	ron Anim	nal Adoptio	on Center	will result in cost savings to the City
It is our u	-		lition to the catt	ery, the City	is consideri	ng further imp	rovements to	
It is our u	-		lition to the catt	ery, the City	is consideri	ng further imp	rovements to	
	derstanding	which in other						the Physics in Income and Main and an Arts of the Income
				an he wholl				
are un awa								er into an agreement for the Center to house cats an
door after	the initial 7	2/96 hour st	raw hold period	Even withe	ut a contrac	t the Foundat	tion has helps	d the City avoid costs by handling one-third of the a
								al intake by almost 50% since 2008, the City's
			annual budget i					
operation	al costs and	associated	annual budget i	haverisen.	nis is illust	r Intake and A	ton page 5 o	our Proposal.
			City of G	reat Fails Ar	limai sneite	r intake and A	associated Bu	iget History
Fiscal Year	Number of	Atrouid	Annual Budget-	Fiscal Year	Number of	Atroual	Annual	Amended Budget Shows the adapted plus outhorized budget amendments for the face
			Actual		Intakes	Budeet-	Budnet-	year. Actual Rodert. Shows the coulted financial edgemation for the fitted year.
	Intakes	Budeet-				Amended	Actual	
			Actual					
		Amended		2016**	1499			"Numbers pulsed fram Annual Shelter Update gaven by Jennifer Rescheit 41 12/09/2028
2008	Intakes 2539		\$588,930	2015**	1488	\$608,633	\$585,803	"Rumbers public from Annual Shabar Opdate gown by Jennifer Rechell of 12/20/2028 section eventsig.
	2539	Amended \$422,000	\$588,930					seasan meetag. **Changed from calendar year to July-sure fical year. As of 03/05,00, the lavest Pate.
		Amended		2015** 2016	1488 1316	\$608,633 \$629,330	\$585,803	entains meeting. **Changed from calendar year to help anneficial year. As of 02/05/00, the Great Palk Stellar webcite states, "Reposeng in March 2015, the Shelter began providing statistic
2009	2539	Amended 5422,000 5513,544	\$588,930	2016	1316	\$629,330	\$586,427	enaum meeting. "Changed from calmular year to July-sun-ficial year. As of 00/20(00; the divisit Palls, Inteller webche salars, 'Angeway in March 2010; the Sheler kepon provaling statistic banden of plant year time former SupSun-gi, or divisit is a constraint with the CPU; I
2009	2539 2295	Amended \$422,000	\$588,930 \$714,227					excase meeting. **Changed Joins calendar year to holy assertional peak. As of 62010/00, the down Palls, based an advance scalars, "Beginneng an about \$2011, the Sherey Repos providing statistics based on place peak time (based based based and an advance to be calendare with the DPVI based on place to be the statistics of the statistics of the statistics of the DPVI calendar with the DPVI and the statistics of the statistics of the Sherey Report calendar with the DPVI and the statistics of the statistics of the Sherey Report calendar with the DPVI and the statistics of the Sherey Report and the Sherey Report statistics of the DPVI and the Sherey Report and the Sherey
1009	2539 2295	Amended 5422,000 5513,544	\$588,930 \$714,227	2016 2017	1316 1296	\$629,330 \$647,856	\$586,427 \$608,942	section eventing. ***Changed from calmeter year to help averificati year. As of Q2012Q2, the forward help before validate frame, "Ingenering in Month? 2021, the Shelter league providing calculate barreles of focal year time (years (but-)-bur), in order to be constant with the CDV is payring embady. Provider (years in burner 1992). Coller to their anneal regards year bails (barreles or year bails (pairsing) Optimited, Coller to their anneal regards year bails to be of the anneal does also bails to be order. Year bails and the second sequent of the anneal does also bails to be order year bails.
1009	2539 2285 2282	Amended \$422,000 \$513,544 \$570,431	\$588,930 \$714,227 \$547,687*	2016	1316	\$629,330	\$586,427	results remember "Anchanged junc states", mein sich eine State inner und 2000/0000, 10 winner sich "Anchanged junc states", Majorisen (2000), 20000, 2000, 2000, 2000, 2000, 2000, 2000, 2000, 2000,
1009 1010	2539 2285 2282	Amended \$422,000 \$513,544 \$570,431	\$588,930 \$714,227 \$547,687*	2016 2017	1316 1296	\$629,330 \$647,856	\$586,427 \$608,942	analise eventse. ***Changed from calcular year thoday averyfacial year. An of 02/01/02, 13m/01/mit Mittalian States website calcular, "Regioning in North 2011, this Sherter langua providing institution landers on years per time from (buy) - share, it was the to be constant with the CPV is regioning website. The reveared gives in the time the 2012 cold in Sherter language regioning and the shert the cold of the shert of the cold of the co
1009 1010 1011 1012	2539 2295 2282 1995 1720	Amended 5422,000 5513,544 5570,431 5725,924 5525,864	5588,930 5714,227 5547,687* 5592,630* 5483,760*	2016 2017	1316 1296	\$629,330 \$647,856	\$586,427 \$608,942	results remember "Anchanged junc states", mein sich eine State inner und 2000/0000, 10 winner sich "Anchanged junc states", Majorisen (2000), 20000, 2000, 2000, 2000, 2000, 2000, 2000, 2000, 2000,
2008 2009 2010 2011 2012 2012 2013	2539 2285 2282 1995	Amended \$422,000 \$513,544 \$570,431 \$725,924	\$588,930 \$714,227 \$547,687* \$592,630*	2016 2017 2018	1316 1296 1406	\$629,330 \$647,856 \$707,527	\$586,427 \$608,942 \$662,126	parameters "Second processing and the photo plane uses of all 2002s". The second plane based and all and the photo plane plane of all all all the second reading and the based and all and the photo plane. The photo plane plane plane plane plane plane plane plane plane plane and the second reading and the plane plane plane plane plane plane plane and the plane
1009 1010 1011 1012	2539 2295 2282 1995 1720	Amended 5422,000 5513,544 5570,431 5725,924 5525,864	5588,930 5714,227 5547,687* 5592,630* 5483,760*	2016 2017 2018	1316 1296 1406	\$629,330 \$647,856 \$707,527	\$586,427 \$608,942 \$662,126	Hannersense of the second seco





Second (continued): A contract with the Maclean-Cameron Animal Adoption Center will result in cost savings to the City.

As stated in the Proposal, we can't project what the City's budget will look like if its services are reduced as
proposed. Granted, the City has given the Foundation atom of cost data, but the data would change
drastically one a contract is entered into with the Foundation. That is why the Foundation has assumed and
hoped, as stated in the RFP, that further discussions would be conducted to validate its proposal and to
ensure that cost savings are achieved.

 The Foundation has stated that a contract would effectively lead to a doubling in the number of animals under its care. This will require additional staffing and facility adjustments. All of this was discussed in the Proposel, and supports the Foundation's current projection that it could handle all adoptions, education, fostering, fundraising and volunteer activities in this community for \$475K per year.



Consolidation of efforts would fulfill the earlier vision shared by Foundation and City officials that one modern facility providing high-quality animal care could best handle animal adoption services.

It appears to be a needless duplication of expense and effort to have two neighboring shelters in a City where both public and private resources are relatively scarce.

Because the Center was constructed entirely with donated funds, this has resulted in great savings to the City's taxpayers. Now that the Center has been built and in operation for over four years, it makes sense for the City taxpayers to benefit from this state-of-the-articulty.

Let's give the public the benefit of each party's strengths and end the competition for limited resources and improve animal welfare in our community.





From the Animal Foundation of Great Falls Madean-Cameron Animal Adoption Center