

**MINUTES OF THE MEETING
OF THE
DESIGN REVIEW BOARD
January 23, 2012**

CALL TO ORDER

The regular meeting of the Great Falls Design Review Board was called to order by Mr. Jule Stuver, Chair Pro Tem, at 3:05 p.m. in the Planning and Community Development Department Conference Room in the Civic Center.

ROLL CALL & ATTENDANCE

Design Review Board Members present:

Mr. Jule Stuver
Mr. Bruce Forde
Mr. Todd Humble
Ms. Mary Klette

Design Review Board Members absent:

Ms. Jean Price, Chair

City Staff Members present:

Mr. Charlie Sheets, Development Review Coordinator
Mr. Brant Birkeland, Comprehensive Planner II
Mr. Dave Dobbs, City Engineer
Ms. Patty Cadwell, Neighborhood & Youth Council Coordinator
Mr. Michael Haynes, Director, Planning & Community Development

Others present:

Mr. Dan Bleskin, Pete's Superstore
Mr. Mike Magnuson, Magnuson Construction
Ms. Erin Madison, Great Falls Tribune
Mr. George Wheeler, CTA Architects

MINUTES

Mr. Stuver asked if there were any comments on the minutes of the December 12, 2011 meeting. Mr. Forde moved to approve the minutes as stated. Mr. Humble seconded. All being in favor, the minutes were approved.

OLD BUSINESS

There was no old business.

NEW BUSINESS **Pete's Superstore** **3456 10th Ave South**

Mr. Birkeland, Comprehensive Planner II for the City, reviewed the City staff report on the proposed 960 square foot addition to the existing 1,512 square foot auto-sales office of Pete's Superstore. He stated he was entering the staff report into the record. The expansion includes a virtual replication of the existing structure to provide additional office space and a private restroom. The existing outdoor lighting, landscaping, mechanical equipment and parking are currently compliant with City code and will remain so following the proposed expansion.

The applicant will use materials and architectural features consistent with the existing office building. Staff recommends either continuing the yellow accent band (currently located on the front façade of the building) along the east and west facades continuing to the south, or place a design feature on the east façade of the expansion similar to the existing design feature on the west façade of the existing structure.

Petitioner's Presentation

The Petitioner did not make a presentation.

Public Comment

There was no public comment.

Board Discussion and Action

Mr. Stuver inquired whether the expansion included additional lighting. The Petitioner noted that Northwestern Energy has lighting in the area that provides adequate light for the expansion area. Mr. Forde asked if there was a door being added on the east end. The Petitioner affirmed they were adding a door.

MOTION: That the Design Review Board approve the Design Review application of Pete's Superstore located at 3456 10th Avenue South as shown in the conceptual development plans contained within the staff report and provided within this meeting by the project applicant and representative, subject to the following conditions:

1. The proposed project shall be developed consistent with the conditions in this staff report, all codes and ordinances of the City of Great Falls, the State of Montana, and all other applicable regulatory agencies.

2. If after the approval of the concept development plan as amended by this Board, the owner proposes to expand or modify the conceptual development plans, the Director of the Planning and Community Development Department shall determine in writing if such proposed change would alter the concept for one or more review criteria. If such proposed change would alter the plan, the proposal shall be resubmitted for review as a new application.
3. Continue the yellow accent band currently located on the front façade of the building along the east and west facades of the expansion or include a design feature on the west façade of the expansion to match the existing design feature.

Made by: Ms. Klette
Seconded: Mr. Humble

VOTE: All being in favor, the motion passed.

Mr. Sheets advised the applicant that staff will prepare a letter of approval per conditions as stated in the staff report. Building plans are then to be submitted to the Planning and Community Development Office in order to obtain a building permit.

**Kobe Steak and Seafood
115 3rd Street Northwest**

Mr. Sheets reviewed the City staff report on the proposed construction of a new restaurant in the WEST BANK ONE Development. He stated he was entering the staff report into the record. Kobe Steak and Seafood Restaurant proposes a 5,990 square foot structure on a property area of 42,427 square feet and continues the parking, landscaping, sidewalk and outdoor lighting features contained in the rest of the WEST BANK ONE Development. The restaurant is oriented toward the southwest corner of the property with the entrance facing Staybridge Suites. The proposed entrance does not meet the recommended standard regarding the orientation of the primary entrance.

Mr. Sheets explained that windows on the north, east and west elevations will surround the indoor seating areas. An outdoor patio will be screened with a metal fence, which will also enclose the service entrance on the south side of the building. The southern portion of the building will be ribbed concrete masonry units with stacked shale stone surrounding the windows. The canopies surrounding the building will be earth toned smooth metal and extend 2' 6" out over the windows.

The conceptual parking layout was not complete at the time of writing the staff report, and what portion had been reviewed was a little inconsistent with requirements of the land development code. The applicant is being asked to submit a final site plan to be reviewed. The building will share parking with other buildings within the WEST BANK ONE Development.

Landscaping will be consistent with previous site improvements. Plans submitted have sidewalks surrounded the building but lacked a clear path to Staybridge Suites. The construction of the proposed project is compatible with nearby properties, neighborhood character and natural features. Staff supports approval of this application.

Petitioner's Presentation

Mr. Wheeler of CTA Architects said the metal screen for the patio on the northwest has been deleted from the project. Without a screen, the patio may or may not be built. In addition, Mr. Wheeler submitted a new site plan showing a developed clear pedestrian path between Staybridge Suites and the proposed restaurant. The proposed entrance faces Staybridge Suites because that is the direction from which most customers will come, as well as facing the parking area.

Mr. Stuver noted that he must recuse himself from voting on this project, since it is represented by CTA Architects.

Mr. Forde inquired whether the building materials were the same as those on the Faster Basset building. Mr. Wheeler clarified the materials are not the same. The Board inquired about the entrance to the proposed restaurant facing inside the site instead of the street. Mr. Wheeler stated there will be windows along the street side of the building and passersby will be able to see customers inside sitting at food grills.

Mr. Wheeler stated the dumpster enclosure and grease receptor would be screened with chain link fence with vats due to budget constraints. He said there is a possibility they would incorporate materials used in the front screening fence for the enclosure.

Ms. Klette inquired about landscaping along the south side. Mr. Wheeler said the screening fence will help break up that elevation. Mr. Sheets stated he understood the rubble stone landscaping is to be continued along the southern boundary, and that a metal screening fence was proposed. Mr. Wheeler stated that originally the fencing material was to be chain link, and he was suggesting metal. He said a landscaping plan had not yet been submitted to him.

Mr. Sheets explained that the drawings Mr. Wheeler had submitted for review are the ones being used as a reference point. He noted the landscaping of stone is continued along the southern boundary. Mr. Sheets also noted that submitted drawings show a metal screening fence. Mr. Wheeler stated he would still like to

use the metal screening, and reiterated that landscaping plans have not been submitted to him.

Mr. Sheets asked for clarification on the proposed landscaping. Mr. Wheeler stated the landscaping would continue throughout the site and be consistent with what is now there. The chain link fence would be used for the dumpster enclosure. Mr. Haynes noted the enclosure is very visible from the street. He said he understood the logic of the proposed restaurant entrance facing Staybridge Suites, but added that the dumpster enclosure must therefore be treated carefully to minimize visual impact.

Mr. Forde asked about landscaping and lighting in the islands. He said there should be trees in the islands. Mr. Wheeler stated there will be landscaping. Mr. Sheets stated that the existing site has lighting on the islands, and Mr. Wheeler should convey to the Board whether the characteristics of the existing site will be continued on the proposed development. Mr. Wheeler stated it would be continued consistent with the existing site. Mr. Forde said he preferred knowing what type of plantings will be used, since Quaking Aspen had been planted for Staybridge Suites and those trees are short-lived, they succor profusely, and they are disease prone. He also noted it appeared there would be about 20 feet of concrete along the east side, and asked whether some trees could be planted along the east and south elevations.

Mr. Stuver asked about plantings at Faster Basset. Mr. Sheets said there were planters in front of the building due to soil and water conditions. Mr. Forde said drought tolerant trees would work for this location. Mr. Wheeler agreed to look into landscaping for that area.

There was further discussion regarding enhancing the elevation visible from the street and using materials related to the building for the dumpster enclosure, instead of chain link fence. Mr. Haynes requested clarification of materials for the pedestrian path from Staybridge Suites to the restaurant. Mr. Wheeler stated he would like to see stamped concrete as a dedicated pedestrian walkway, but that has yet to be discussed with Neil Consultants. He stated they would like a better connection to the River's Edge Trail also, but that would be more difficult. Mr. Sheets said that a potential future phase of development extends to Central Avenue West; the sidewalk on Central Avenue West has a direct connection to the River's Edge Trail.

Mr. Forde summarized his recommendations of tree plantings on the site, as noted in the conditions of approval. Mr. Forde inquired about parking requirements. Mr. Sheets stated that the parking site plan has not yet been

submitted, and parking space sizes will need to meet code requirements. He said if the parking does not meet code requirements, the applicant will have to request a variance before the Board of Adjustment. Mr. Haynes said parking requirements will be calculated according to shared use opportunities. Mr. Wheeler stated they are working on a stronger pedestrian connection between the Kobe restaurant and Faster Basset.

Mr. Stuver inquired if a required number of plantings was part of the landscaping. Mr. Sheets said that Staybridge Suites and Faster Basset developments did not meet code requirements for landscaping, He said the landscape review for the proposed restaurant will require consistency for the site in relation to the previous development. Mr. Forde said he hoped that tree plantings for the proposed restaurant would not reduce the number of trees currently on the developed portion of the site. He also stated he would like to see some plantings to screen the dumpster enclosure if less desirable materials are used.

Mr. Sheets asked if there was Board comment on the pedestrian walkways. Mr. Forde said stamped concrete was preferable over striping, but he understood budget constraints and that people would still cut across the parking lot. Discussion followed about whether there was stamped concrete consistently throughout the site and whether it was necessary.

Dave Dobbs, City Engineer, said the storm drain plan had been received and is under review.

Public Comment

There was no public comment.

Board Discussion and Action

There was no further discussion.

MOTION: That the Design Review Board approve the Design Review Application of the Kobe Steak and Seafood Restaurant, addressed as 115 3rd Street Northwest, as shown in the conceptual development plans contained within the staff report and provided within this meeting by the project applicant and representative, subject to the following conditions:

1. The proposed project shall be developed consistent with the conditions in the staff report, all codes and ordinances of the City of Great Falls, the State of Montana, and all other applicable regulatory agencies.

2. If after the approval of the concept development plan as amended by this Board, the owner proposes to expand or modify the conceptual development plans, the Director of the Planning and Community Development Department shall determine in writing if such proposed change would alter the concept for one or more review criteria. If such proposed change would alter the plan, the proposal shall be resubmitted for review as a new application.
3. Provide clear, safe and accessible pedestrian connections to other business in the WEST BANK ONE Development and the existing public sidewalks to ensure safe pedestrian circulation.
4. Two trees be planted in each of the proposed islands, and drought tolerant trees be planted along the east and south sides of the building. Trees to be planted on the north corner if space allows. Sidewalk areas around the building should incorporate cut-outs for trees. Taller plantings should be used along 3rd Street Northwest to help screen. No use of Quaking Aspens; possible use of Linden trees.
5. Enhance the 3rd Street Northwest elevation by breaking up materials used so the elevation is not one solid material.
6. The dumpster enclosure should reflect materials used on the building.

Made by: Mr. Humble
Seconded: Ms. Klette

VOTE: Mr. Stuver recused himself from the vote. All others being in favor, the motion carried 3-0.

Mr. Sheets advised the applicant that he will send them a letter outlining the conditions of this approval. Foundation plans are already approved. Building plans are to be submitted to the City, along with the pedestrian walkway plans and landscaping plans, in order to obtain building permits.

**City Motor Company
3900 10th Avenue South**

Mr. Stuver with CTA Architects being the presenting architect for this project, Mr. Humble assumed the position of Chair Pro Tem for this presentation.

Mr. Birkeland, Comprehensive Planner II for the City, reviewed the Staff report on the proposed exterior renovation and expansion of the City Motor Company commercial building located at 3900 10th Avenue South. The renovation portion of the project does not represent a significant change or modification in the building. The proposed 1,100 square foot expansion to the north elevation is adjacent to existing office space and will

include two additional office spaces and a vehicle delivery area. The applicant has proposed an entry portal element to highlight the center of the main show room. This feature will be constructed on a separate foundation and is offset by 18 inches. Staff will treat the entry portal element as a sign.

The landscaping requirements of the City code are triggered by the proposed expansion. Given the nature of the auto-sales use, the character of adjacent and surrounding uses, and the location in the C-2 zoning district, staff recommends the applicant request a design waiver and also provide additional plantings within the existing landscaped areas.

Petitioner's Presentation

Mr. Stuver explained details of the proposed renovation and expansion. He explained that the entry portal is a pre-fabricated unit that will extend higher than the building.

Mr. Stuver offered to answer any questions from the Board. Mr. Forde suggested that the landscaping additions reflect the landscaping in place at the Toyota portion of the business. He inquired about existing islands. Mr. Stuver said there were islands and that there might currently be a single tree in each island. Mr. Forde suggested a single tree in the islands would look good on the sides of the building. Discussion followed about the use of ornamental grasses in the landscaping additions.

Mr. Stuver explained the front service doors were being replaced with overhead doors to allow more natural light.

Public Comment

There was no public comment.

Board Discussion and Action

There was no further discussion.

MOTION: That the Design Review Board approve the Design Review Application of City Motor Company located at 3900 10th Avenue South, as shown in the conceptual development plans contained within the staff report and provided within this meeting by the project applicant and representative, subject to the following conditions:

1. The proposed project shall be developed consistent with the conditions in the staff report, all codes and ordinances of the City of Great Falls, the State of Montana, and all other applicable regulatory agencies.
2. If after the approval of the concept development plan as amended by this Board, the owner proposes to expand or modify the conceptual development plans, the

Director of the Planning and Community Development Department shall determine in writing if such proposed change would alter the concept for one or more review criteria. If such proposed change would alter the plan, the proposal shall be resubmitted for review as a new application.

3. The applicant request and be granted a design waiver signed by the Director of Planning and Community Development and also provide additional plantings within the existing landscaped areas, including the use of single trees in existing islands along the sides of the building, and the use of ornamental grasses.

Made by: Mr. Humble
Seconded: Mr. Forde

VOTE: All being in favor, the motion carried 3-0.

OTHER BOARD BUSINESS

There was no other business.

ADJOURNMENT

The meeting was adjourned at 4:16 p.m.